

Materials Review Committee  
 Reconsideration of Materials Summary – 2015

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
Jan. 2015	<p><b>Atonement</b></p> <p>Written by Ian McEwan, Knopf Canada, 2001</p> <p>Adult Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Poor grammar and sentence structure</li> <li>• Remove from the collection</li> <li>• Form a committee to review all books before they are added to the collection</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Set in pre-war, wartime and present-day England, the novel examines the tragic consequences of a lie and the need for personal atonement.</li> <li>• The author is a critically-acclaimed and prize-winning novelist and the reviews of the book were uniformly positive.</li> <li>• The book remains in demand and is held by over 3,000 libraries worldwide.</li> <li>• All new adult books are selected by the Adult Materials Selection Committee, which is composed of experienced librarians, using the criteria listed in the Materials Selection Policy.</li> <li>• <b>Retained in the adult fiction collection</b></li> </ul>
Feb. 2015	<p><b>Soraida, A Woman of Palestine</b></p> <p>Directed by Tahani Rached, National Film Board of Canada, 2004</p> <p>Adult DVD</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Propaganda – not based on factual events</li> <li>• No artistic or educational merit</li> <li>• Remove from the collection</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Soraida, a Palestinian woman and her circle of family and friends share their experiences during the Israeli occupation of Ramallah in 2002. Some of their experiences and dreams are re-enacted.</li> <li>• The director is a well-known Egyptian-Canadian film-maker whose work has been featured in the Toronto Hot Docs festival.</li> <li>• The film was positively reviewed and was recommended for high school students by the educational magazine <i>CM: Canadian Review of Materials</i>.</li> <li>• The film is subjective in nature and there is no requirement that documentaries contain news footage. The occupation of Ramallah has been documented by various reputable news sources. The re-enactments are clearly identified as such.</li> </ul>

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Library’s Materials Selection Policy states that “The Library selects contemporary materials representing varying points of view and which are of current interest and possible future significance, including materials that reflect current conditions, trends and controversies”.</li> <li>• The Library’s large collection of material about the history of and conflict in the Middle East provides a variety of perspectives and points of view.</li> <li>• <b>Retained in the adult DVD collection</b></li> </ul>
Apr. 2015	<p><b>A Heartbreaking Work of Staggering Genius</b></p> <p>Written by Dave Eggers, Simon &amp; Schuster, 2000</p> <p>Adult Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Contains profanity and poor grammar and sentence structure</li> <li>• Remove from the collection</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This memoir describes Eggers’ struggles in raising his younger brothers following the death of their parents.</li> <li>• It was very well reviewed and was nominated for a Pulitzer Prize.</li> <li>• The book remains in demand and is owned by over 2,000 libraries worldwide.</li> <li>• <b>Retained in the adult nonfiction collection</b></li> </ul>
Jul. 2015	<p><b>The Troublemakers</b></p> <p>Written and illustrated by Gilbert Hernandez, Fantagraphics, 2009</p> <p>Adult Graphic Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sexual language and depictions of prostitution and violence</li> <li>• Institute a labelling system for graphic books so children cannot borrow them and victims of violence can avoid them</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Drug dealers and gang members clash in this graphic novel.</li> <li>• Hernandez is a critically-acclaimed graphic novelist best known for the series <i>Love and Rockets</i>. He has won a number of awards including the PEN Graphic Literature Award.</li> <li>• The book received positive reviews in a variety of publications including <i>Booklist</i> and is popular with customers.</li> <li>• The Materials Selection Policy states that the Library does not label materials except videos, where viewing age is determined by law.</li> <li>• The Materials Selection Policy states that, “children are entitled to borrowing privileges and open and ready access to materials...provided by the Library. Parents and legal</li> </ul>

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
			<p>guardians are responsible for monitoring and limiting the use of Library materials by their children.” This reiterates the <i>Ontario Library Association’s Position on Children’s Rights in the Public Library</i>, which informs the Policy.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Library is sensitive to the fact that the graphic format may be attractive to children and children’s, teen and adult graphic books are shelved separately based on content and intended audience.</li> <li>• <b>Retained in the adult graphic book collection</b></li> </ul>
Sep. 2015	<p><b>Cyanide and Happiness: Punching Zoo</b></p> <p>Written and illustrated by Ron DenBleyher, Kris Wilson, Dave McElfatrick and Matt Melvin, Boom! Box, 2014</p> <p>Teen Graphic Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Contains vulgar language, humour related to pornography, racism and sex</li> <li>• Move to adult collection</li> <li>• Consider dividing teen graphic book section into younger and older teens</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The book is a collection of the popular webcomic strips <i>Cyanide and Happiness</i>, which are posted daily on sites like Reddit and Facebook.</li> <li>• Reaction to the content is mixed with some reviewers admiring the dark humour while others find it offensive.</li> <li>• The committee agreed that the book is more appropriate for the adult collection.</li> <li>• A two-tiered arrangement for teen graphic books is not feasible as there is no consistent labeling of age-appropriateness by publishers.</li> <li>• <b>Transferred to the adult graphic book collection</b></li> </ul>
Dec. 2015	<p><b>The Black Hole</b></p> <p>Disney Enterprises, 2007</p> <p>Children’s DVD</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Some images too violent and frightening for children</li> <li>• Move to the adult collection</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This is Disney’s first foray into “serious” films – a space adventure heavily influenced by <i>Star Wars</i>.</li> <li>• Several reviewers found the film contradictory as the tone is dark but cute child-friendly robots are also featured.</li> <li>• The committee agreed that some scenes could be disturbing for children and it will be moved to the adult collection.</li> <li>• <b>Transferred to the adult DVD collection</b></li> </ul>