

**Materials Review Committee
Reconsideration of Materials Summary – 2010**

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
Mar 2010	Swans in the Mist Written by D. E. Athkins, Simon Pulse, 2006 Teen Book	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contains sadistic scenes • Might give teens violent ideas • Move from teen to adult collection 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This book belongs to the popular teen horror and suspense genre, was written by a well-known author of this genre and the writing style and plot are appropriate for the teen audience • While the heroine does endure hardships, good triumphs over evil and the villain is punished • Retained in the teen fiction collection
Mar 2010	“Good Evening Vietnam” Written by Brian McNally in <i>Vanity Fair Magazine</i> , April 2008 Adult Magazine Article	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Article borders on hate literature in description of Vietnamese women and poor • Remove magazine if a similar article is published and write letter to <i>Vanity Fair</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The article was published in “Letters from...” series and reflects the personal opinions of the author • <i>Vanity Fair</i> is a mainstream, popular magazine known, among other things, for its sometimes controversial articles • Retained in the adult collection

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
May 2010	Tintin in the Congo Written by Hergé, Egmont, 2005 Children's Book	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depicts Africans in stereotypical fashion that is no longer acceptable • Remove from children's collection, if not from the system collection 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The book was published in French in 1931 and in English in 1991 as part of the popular <i>Tintin</i> series • It is available in English, French and other languages at most large Canadian libraries • It has often been criticized as having racist and colonialist views and the author has made a number of revisions to the content • The Library's edition contains a forward explaining the colonial attitudes that prevailed when it was written • However, the committee agreed that its content makes it inappropriate for the children's collection as a child is unlikely to read the foreword and place the book in its historical context. It recommended that the book be placed in the adult graphic collection where it would still be accessible to children but more likely with adult guidance as to its content • Moved to adult graphic book collection
July 2010	The Man Handler Written by Cairo, Strebor Books, 2009 Adult book	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Book is pornography • Do not purchase future books by this author 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The book is an example of the popular and fast-growing urban fiction genre that features inner-city settings, a dark tone and which may contain profanity, sex and violence • Initially self-published, mainstream publishers have established imprints that specialize in it; this title is published by an imprint of Simon & Schuster • Urban fiction is very popular with Library users and this title circulated over 100 times in six months. It fulfils the Library's mandate of meeting the needs of a diverse public • Retained in the adult fiction collection

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
Aug 2010	Bruno Written by Sacha Baron Cohen and others, Universal Studios, 2009 Adult DVD, 18A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Material is pornographic and shocking • Remove from collection 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Bruno</i> is a widely-released mainstream film written by and acted in by well-known comic actor and satirist, Sacha Baron Cohen • Like Cohen's other film <i>Borat</i>, <i>Bruno</i> ridicules the ignorance and prejudices of its unwitting participants, and targets homophobia and celebrity culture. In doing so it is intentionally outrageous and offensive • The film is rated 18A and cannot be borrowed by anyone under 18 • Retained in the adult collection
Sept 2010	War Stories Volume 1 Written by Garth Ennis, Vertigo/DC Comics, 2004 Adult graphic novel	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contains sexual content and visually explicit pictures not suitable for children or youth • Remove from the collection 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adult graphic books contain mature themes and the immediacy and visual impact of the illustrations may be powerful and disturbing; they are shelved in the adult collection • The book is a collection of four stories about different aspects of WWII and received favourable reviews • It deals with some of the violent and gruesome aspects of war and is classified accordingly as an adult book and shelved in the adult collection • Retained in the adult collection

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
Oct 2010	<p>The Waiting Dog</p> <p>Written and illustrated by Carolyn and Andrea Beck, Kids Can Press, 2003 Children's Picture Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contains obscene content, language and pictures • Remove from the collection 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The book tells the story of a dog waiting for a mailman and fantasizing about eating him; when the mailman actually arrives, the dog greets him happily • Reviewers agreed that the dark humour would appeal to older readers and the book is classified as an advanced picture book, a collection for children seven and older • As part of the cover illustration, there is a large warning label alerting browsers to potentially scary content • The book is popular with Library users and is in the collections of almost 100 Canadian and U.S. libraries • Retained in the advanced picture book children's collection
Dec 2010	<p>CFA: 100 Success Secrets – 100 Most Asked Questions</p> <p>Written by Howard Cohen, Lightning Source, 2008 Adult Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Book purports to be a test preparation but is useless for that purpose • Content does not provide useful information for writing the CFA (Chartered Financial Analyst) exam • Remove from the collection 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The book is a collection of articles some of which are totally irrelevant, e.g. CFA as Cat Fanciers' Association • The committee found that it contains out-of-date (exam dates for previous year), unreliable and misleading information as well as numerous grammatical and typographical mistakes • It is not useful for its intended audience of CFA students • Removed from the collection

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
Dec 2010	<p>The New Adventures of Jesus Christ: The Second Coming</p> <p>Written by Frank Stack, Fantagraphics, 2007 Adult Graphic Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Offensive joke book about God whose purpose is to degrade and insult the Christian religion • Remove from the collection 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The book is a compilation of satirical comics published originally in the 60's and 70's and was well reviewed • The target is not Jesus but contemporary American society, which is depicted as immoral and chaotic, as exemplified in its mixed reception of Christ's second coming • <i>Booklist's</i> reviewer stated, "The intention is to pillory everything except Jesus. The results are irreverent and sacrilegious but not blasphemous" • Stack is a well-known comic artist and a major figure in the underground comics movement to which this work belongs • Retained in the adult collection